

IMPLEMENTATION OF ARTICLE 31E OF BANDAR LAMPUNG CITY REGULATION NO. 03 OF 2017 CONCERNING TOURISM (Study of the Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office)

Syamsuddin Pasamai¹, Argha Pandu Mulia Naibaho², Ade Santika³,
Angga Wahyudi⁴, Wibawa Tirta Kusuma⁵.

University of Bandar Lampung, Indonesia. Email: arghapandu54@gmail.com

Abstract

The culinary industry in Bandar Lampung City is one of the main sources of livelihood for the local community. The government regulates this sector through Regional Regulation No. 3 of 2017 on Tourism to ensure proper management of tourism destinations, including culinary tourism. This study employs a normative juridical and empirical approach, with a deductive reasoning method. The findings show that the implementation of Article 31E has not been optimal, as evidenced by violations committed by businesses such as Angles Wing and XO Stars Coffee, and the weak supervision by the Tourism Office. Licensing obstacles are divided into internal factors (from law enforcement institutions) and external factors (the community and business actors), in line with Thomas R. Dye's legal policy theory. It is recommended that the government revise the regulation, clarify the distinction between Articles 31E and 31G, and enhance supervision and evaluation of relevant institutions and culinary tourism business actors.

Keywords: Implementation, Regional Regulations, Tourism.

Abstract

Industri kuliner di Kota Bandar Lampung menjadi salah satu sumber mata pencaharian utama masyarakat. Pemerintah mengatur sektor ini melalui Perda No. 3 Tahun 2017 tentang Pariwisata guna menjaga pengelolaan destinasi wisata, termasuk kuliner. Penelitian ini menggunakan pendekatan yuridis normatif dan empiris, disimpulkan secara deduktif. Hasil penelitian menunjukkan bahwa implementasi Pasal 31E belum optimal, terlihat dari pelanggaran oleh pelaku usaha seperti Angles Wing dan XO Stars Coffee, serta lemahnya pengawasan dari Dinas Pariwisata. Hambatan perizinan terbagi atas faktor internal (dari lembaga penegak hukum) dan eksternal (masyarakat dan pelaku usaha), sesuai teori kebijakan hukum Thomas R. Dye. Disarankan agar pemerintah merevisi Perda tersebut, memperjelas perbedaan Pasal 31E dan 31G, serta meningkatkan pengawasan dan evaluasi terhadap instansi serta pelaku usaha wisata kuliner.

Kata kunci: Pelaksanaan, Peraturan Daerah, Pariwisata.

INTRODUCTION

Background

Indonesia is one of the archipelagic countries that has an enchanting natural and marine tourism industry, besides that it also has the attraction of culinary delights typical

of the archipelago. The tourism industry is an example of long-term economic activity. The development and existence of the tourism sector can benefit the government, private companies, and all communities involved in utilizing the tourism industry.

Tourism has an important role in increasing a country's foreign exchange as well as in increasing regional income. Indonesia as an archipelagic country that has abundant natural wealth and diverse culture is a potential tourist attraction spread throughout Indonesia(Pasamai, 2020; Rusli & Ompu Jainah, 2024)

Culinary is part of the tourism industry that is attractive to local people and foreign tourists. Various culinary products are offered by business actors at various prices. Culinary Business Very interesting for the public because of the large interest in culinary tourism in Indonesia. (Jainah, 2023)

The development of tourism in a tourist destination area will always be taken into account with benefits for the wider community, namely economically, socially, and culturally.¹ The culinary business is classified as a business that is quite easy to do because it only requires a place and then the type of food and drinks to be served. (Besta, 2024)

Bandar Lampung is the capital city of Lampung Province which is located on the island of Sumatra, has an area of 197.2 Km2. and is a city with a very fast development rate. The development that occurs in the city of Bandar Lampung is not spared from the development and development of the tourism sector. There are tourist attractions in Bandar Lampung City, the entertainment center in Bandar Lampung City is one of the tourist attractions that has a high interest in tourists visiting, one of which is the food or culinary business.(Robert Enakesda & Zainab Ompu Jainah, 2024)

The culinary industry in the city of Bandar Lampung has a high attraction for the local community as part of their livelihood. The food business located in the city of Bandar Lampung is increasing over time due to the growth of the number of enthusiasts in the culinary field, another thing that is the reason for the rapid interest in culinary tourism is the growth of the tourism economy located around the city of Bandar Lampung.(Zainab Ompu Jainah & Fasholli Milyar Sulaiman, n.d.)

¹ Yustisia Kristiana et al. 2018. *Exploration of the Potential of Culinary Tourism for Tourism Development in Tangerang City*. Journal of Scientific Treasures, Vol. 9, No. 1, p. 19

Considering the city of Bandar Lampung to manage the economy in various sectors, especially culinary tourism, the Bandar Lampung city government created a regulation for tourism destinations including the culinary industry. The regulation is contained in a Regional Regulation No. 3 of 2017 concerning tourism, which aims to make the tourism destinations of the city of Bandar Lampung run well and under control. In the Regional Regulation, the food business is regulated in Article 31 E of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 which reads "The business field of food and beverage services includes the following types of business: a. Restaurant; b. Restaurant; c. Bars/drinking houses; d. Coffee; e. Food sales centers; f. Property."(Barusman et al., 2021; Pasamai, 2020)

There are many culinary businesses established by the people of Bandar Lampung City, so there needs to be intervention from the local government, government intervention is supervision and regulation of existing permits. The supervision and arrangement of permits is intended so that the existing business runs smoothly, orderly and orderly. Permits are one-sided acts of state administrative law that are applied in regulations based on requirements and procedures as provided by law. State administrative law is defined as the legal regulation that governs administration, namely the relationship between citizens and their government that is the cause until the state functions(Rusli & Ompu Jainah, 2024).(Akasi et al., 2021)

Actors in the food business industry must understand the licensing procedures related to food business industry permits to avoid unnecessary consequences. Currently, there are many restaurant entrepreneurs who do not have or understand business licenses, as happened in the city of Bandar Lampung, this is because many people do not appreciate permits even though the permit is an important part of their desire to open a business.

Licensing Law is part of the State administrative law, as for the meaning of licensing itself is to perform an act that is in public law based on certain authority based on the determination of an application from a person or legal entity on the issue requested. The service standards for licensing tourism business registration include the types of services, legal basis contained in the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia Number 18 of 2016 concerning tourism business registration, service requirements, system mechanisms and procedures, settlement periods, service products, complaint handling, suggestions and inputs.(Negara et al., 2021)

At the government level, the party that takes care of licensing in Bandar Lampung City is the investment office and one-stop integrated service. The existence of DPMPTSP makes it easier for the government to record, foster, supervise and regulate existing permits in the city of Bandar Lampung. In addition, the government is able to get adequate income for regional financing in Bandar Lampung City. Government Regulation Number 24 of 2018 concerning electronically integrated business licensing services Article 39 broadly regulates the fulfillment of commercial/operational license commitments that must be carried out by business actors so that business licenses or commercial licenses can be effective (Rusli et al., n.d.).

Food business industry players often ignore the permits that have been granted by the local government in the activities of implementing the business, the implementation of business activities that are not in accordance with the permits given, and even business activities that are contrary to the permits that often occur. as reported in the Lampung Media news portal Angel's Wing bar and café was sealed by Mayor Eva Dwiana because its permit was not in accordance with the one submitted to the Bandar Lampung City Government². This, of course, can disrupt public order and reduce regional income with further consequences that can reduce community welfare.

In the method or regulation of the law there are actions that must be carried out which are nothing but the form of law enforcement, the law is created to be implemented, therefore, it is not surprising to say that the law can no longer be called a law, if it has never been implemented (Siregig et al., 2021). (Alam & Erlina, 2021; Hartono, 2011)

Law enforcement is essentially the enforcement of abstract ideas or concepts. Law enforcement is an effort to turn these ideas into reality³. In business licensing violations, law enforcement that needs to be carried out continuously by the government is supervision and enforcement of administrative sanctions. Law Enforcement is a dynamizer of legislation, through decisions in law enforcement, laws and regulations become alive and applied according to the needs and development of society.

² <https://medialampung.disway.id/read/657863/hearing-dengan-dprd-bandar-lampung-pihak-angels-wings-akui-salah-dan-akan-urus-perizinan> . 10:48. 27/07/2023

³ Satjipto Rahardjo. 1983. *Law Enforcement Issues A Sociological Review*, Sinar Baru. Bandung. p.15.

RESEARCH METHODS

The research method in this study is a normative juridical approach and an empirical approach and is concluded with a deductive way of thinking so that it becomes an overview of the answer to the problem based on the results of the research.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

A. Implementation of Article 31E of Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism (Study of the Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office)

The Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office has the task of assisting the Mayor in carrying out government affairs that are the regional authority in the tourism sector, including Destination Development, Marketing Development, Tourism Institutional Development, and Creative Economy based on the principles of autonomy and legislation.

Based on the results of an interview with Mr. Ariyawan, S.H, M.H. (Head of the Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office), business actors before starting a culinary business in Bandar Lampung City must have a permit issued from the OSS application under the auspices of the Bandar Lampung City DPMPTSP. By making this restaurant business license, you will get several uses that are indispensable for culinary business, including:

1. Shows that the company's security and operations have met the standards
2. Indicates that each product is fit for consumption
3. Gaining public trust
4. Have official legality

Results of an interview regarding tourism business mark registration (PTUD) with Mr. Ariyawan In 2018, the government implemented the *Online Single Submission* (OSS) system for companies and individuals who want to take care of business licenses. For business licenses in the form of restaurants or cafes, business licenses from the government are in the form of Tourism Business Registration Certificates (TDUP) which are regulated in Permenpar Number 10 of 2018.

To make a TDUP, there are several documents that must be prepared by business actors, namely:

1. Deed of Establishment and Ministerial Decree

A deed of incorporation can be made with the help of a notary. Meanwhile, the establishment of a company's legal entity was authorized through the Decree of the Minister of Law and Human Rights. However, this deed is only intended for business entities in the form of Limited Liability Companies (PT), CVs and Firms. If you are opening a sole proprietorship, then this document is not required.

2. Business Owner Identity Card

Identity card in the form of an ID card of the owner and director of the company, accompanied by a document proving tax compliance and a copy of the NPWP. If the owner is also a director of the company, it means that only one person is counted. All documents are photocopied multiple copies, as they will be used as attachments in many files.

3. Nuisance Permit Letter

The HO or *Hinder Ordonnantie* letter is to guarantee that the proposed business gets interference approval from neighbors, settlements, or the community around the place of business. In addition to obtaining approval from neighbors in all four corners of the location, the classification of nuisance permits is also categorized based on business scale, land area, intensity of nuisance, and whether the location is on the side of the primary or secondary road. If the location area is less than or equal to 100m², the management of the HO Letter is carried out at the village office, while if the location area is wider than that, then the management is carried out at the sub-district office or mayor. In addition to the HO Letter, they are usually also asked for a Building Permit (IMB) in accordance with the business plan.

4. Certificate of Domicile (SKD)

5. SKD is obtained from the village or sub-district and states that the business location is properly owned by the person who submitted. As well as stating that the business location is not in dispute or problem.

6. After all the legal documents are met, then the applicant is required to fill out several statement letters (usually varying depending on the needs of each district/city). Generally, it includes a stamped statement whose content is willing to follow applicable rules and norms, does not violate laws and laws, declares all original

documents, is willing to follow tax rules, pays regional levies, guarantees peace, and others.

Adding the results of an interview with Mr. Dirmansya, S.T, MPSDA (as the secretary of the Bandar Lampung City tourism office). Applicants are required to take care of a Healthy Fitness Certificate (SLS) if the TDUP has been received. This certificate of recognition guarantees the health of the procedures and the food and beverage products sold. This certificate is a mandatory requirement in many regions. In some big cities such as Jakarta, Bandung, etc.

The requirements for obtaining SLS include having a certification of hygiene hygiene training / courses organized by course and training institutions in collaboration with the Health Office. At least two course certificates are required, namely for Business Managers and at least one person for Food Handlers, including *chefs*, *baristas*, or other managers who are in direct contact with food and beverages.

Furthermore, according to the results of the interview with Mr. Dirmansyah about TDUP and SLS are requirements to obtain a Business License Number (NIB). NIB is used as a replacement for the Company Registration Certificate (TDP) which was previously used as a license to establish a tourism business. If the TDUP has been fully registered but the SLS is still in process, then the owner is given between 3 to 12 months to take care of it, and then get the NIB. A violation of culinary tourism licensing has occurred at the Angels wings lampung café and bar in February 2023. The sealing of the Angels Wing Cafe and Restaurant by the Bandar Lampung City Government was not without cause, Angels Wing turned out to be abusing its operating permit. The business licenses submitted to the Bandar Lampung City Government are restaurants and cafes, but in reality many activities in Angels Wing violate the permit.

Interview Results with one of the Angels wing staff Erik. The violation that occurred in February 2023 was just a miscommunication with the Bandar Lampung city government, namely the DPMPTSP and the Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office. The concept of angel wings lampung is a modern style restaurant and café with *DJ* entertainment, but the problem has been solved by meeting the Bandar Lampung city government. The seal for our café and restaurant business has been revoked, now it has also been renamed AW Live Home LAMPUNG. The business organizers also follow the rules that have been implemented in the city of Bandar Lampung.

Another case is a violation of the Permit for the environment committed by Xo Stars Coffee in June 2023, where Xo Stars Coffee itself often disturbs the comfort of the community with loud music so that it causes noise for the surrounding community. In addition to the noise, Xo Stars coffee often invites *DJs* so that people consider it no longer as a café and restaurant but a discotheque. Due to complaints from the public, the Tourism Office and DPMPTSP came to Xo Stars Coffee to be given a Warning Letter.

Based on the results of the interview with Azil as one of the employees of Xo Stars Coffee, the noise that occurs is actually still within reasonable limits because there is often *live* music, and also the location of Xo Stars Coffee itself is an open model, so the sound may be heard to the neighbors. Moreover, Xo Stars Coffee is located in a residential area. For *live* DJs themselves, it is just entertainment, there is no aim to change the concept of Xo Stars Coffee, which was previously a restaurant and café, into a discotheque. We have arranged the sound of the music and it does not exceed our restaurant and café area, so we have solved the problem well to the law enforcement and residents around Xo Stars Coffee.

Lawrence M. Friedman Regarding the theory of the legal system related to the problems of the implementation process of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation Article 31E No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism stated that the effectiveness and success of law enforcement depends on three elements of the legal system, namely the structure *of law*, the substance *of the law* and the *legal culture*.

1. The substance *of the law* is the rules, norms, and patterns of real human behavior that exist in the system. Or it can be said to be a real result, a product produced, published by the legal system. The element of substance includes the actual rules, norms and patterns of behavior of the people in the system. The legal substance of this research is the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia Number 10 of 2018 concerning Electronically Integrated Business Licensing Services for the Tourism Sector and Article 31E of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning tourism which reads "The business field of food and beverage services, among others, includes the types of businesses: a. Restaurants; b. Restaurant; c. Bars/drinking houses; d. Coffee; e. Food sales centers; f. Jasa hada".

2. *The structure of law* is an institution created by the legal system with various functions in order to support the functioning of the system. This component makes it possible to see how the legal system provides services for the regular processing of legal materials. In this case, the Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office, Bandar Lampung City DPMPTSP, Bandar Lampung City Satpol PP which are institutional components function in order to support the work of the implementation system of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning tourism.
3. Legal culture is human attitudes towards the law and the legal system, its beliefs, values, thoughts, and expectations. Culture or legal culture is in the form of attitudes and actions of the community and the values they adhere. Or it can also be said that legal culture is the entire interweaving of social values related to the law along with attitudes that affect the law, such as shame, guilt when breaking the law and so on. The treatment violated the Licensing Process carried out by the business actors of XO Stars Coffee and AW Live Home Lampung along with the existence of community conflicts with business actors. It is a culture of law, norms and human attitudes that are within the scope of the city of Bandar Lampung.

Based on the results of the above theoretical description, it can be analyzed that the implementation of Article 31E of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism has been implemented but is still not optimal. There are still several obstacles as there are in the theory of the legal system, namely the substance of the law, the structure of the law, and the culture of the law.

B. Inhibiting Factors in the Implementation of Article 31E of Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism.

Culinary Tourism is a form of business activity regulated in the Bandar Lampung City Regulation Number 3 of 2017. In the implementation of the Bandar Lampung City Culinary Tourism Licensing Process, there are factors that hinder the enforcement of the law so that this law enforcement is not realized.

Based on the results of the interview with Mr. Dirmansyah as the secretary of the tourism office. Explaining that the case that occurred in Angles wing lampung is the

difference in the concept of business forms as contained in the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism Article 31E, namely the food and beverage service business sector. It is true that in that Article the point is culinary tourism, but for the Angels wing itself has included the provisions of Article 31G, namely the business field of entertainment and recreation when looking at the concepts they apply such as *live* DJs, alcoholic beverages and preparing a place to dance like a discotheque. So that the Tourism Office and DPMPTSP sealed the Lampung Wings, the sealing has also been carried out in accordance with Article 68 Paragraph 2 of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism in the form of administrative sanctions, namely the temporary freezing of business activities.

Additional from Mr. Dirmansyah regarding the violation of the culinary tourism permit carried out by Angels wing ended with an agreement between the business organizer and the Bandar Lampung City government, the content of the agreement is:

1. Angels Wing must carry out business activities in accordance with the permits owned, namely restaurants and cafes.
2. Angels wing in running a business does not display binger music such as *live* DJs, there are no accompanying lights and do not prepare a place to dance like the disco business.
3. Angels wing living tables are used for serving food and drinks and are not dominated by alcoholic beverages.
4. Angels wing does not sell Group B and C alcoholic beverages in carrying out business activities.
5. Angels wing is required to comply with operating hours in accordance with the regulations.
6. Angels wing maintains security and order in carrying out business activities.
7. Angels wing conducts business activities with applicable regulations.
8. Angels wing Responsible for all impacts arising from business activities carried out.
9. Angels wing is willing to have its business license revoked or permanently closed if it violates the terms that have been agreed.

Continuing the results of the interview for the second case with Mr. Dirmansyah about the violations committed by Xo Stars Coffee Almost the same as the Angels wing, namely the difference in business operations with the Bandar Lampung City Regulation

No. 03 of 2017. Xo Stars Coffee featured a DJ and made noise so that it disturbed the community. In fact, in TDUP, it is mandatory to comply with and include a Letter of Disruption aimed at the security and order of the business area. For Xo Stars itself, the Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office only provides a written reprimand in accordance with Article 68 Paragraph 2 of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism in the form of administrative sanctions, namely written reprimands. Xo Stars itself immediately complied with the content of the reprimand and complied with the applicable regulations.

Based on the results of the interview above, it can be understood that the inhibiting factor of the Implementation of Article 31E of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism is the existence of illegal activities carried out by culinary tourism entrepreneurs for personal gain, without heeding the regulations that have been in force, namely the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism.

The theory of public policy by Thomas R. Dye explains that public *policy is what ever government chooses to do or not to do* Indonesian. And if the government chooses to do something, there must be a goal (object) because public policy includes all government actions, so it is not merely a statement of the wishes of the government or government officials. In addition, something that is not implemented by the government is also included in the policy of the State. Regarding the theory of public policy put forward by Thomas R. Dye about public *policy is what ever government chooses to do or not to do*. Business actors as legal subjects must comply with the regulations that have been set by the government.

Xo Stars Coffee and AW Live Home Lampung have followed the registration flow that has been stipulated in the Regulation of the Minister of Tourism of the Republic of Indonesia Number 10 of 2018 concerning Electronically Integrated Business Licensing Services for the Tourism Sector As stated by Thomas R. Dye, namely *to do* where business actors have met the requirements for a business license. But Xo Stars Coffe and AW Live Lampung also violate the regulations that have been set by the government as *no to do* or what not to do stated by Thomas R. Dye, The violations committed by Xo Star Coffe and AW Live Home Lampung do not comply with 10 of 2018 concerning Electronically Integrated Business Licensing Services for the Tourism Sector where there

is a condition that must be met by business actors in Article 13 letter b, namely environment where it means must obtain permission from the surrounding environment and is obliged to maintain public order. *The second not to do* done by Xo Star Coffe and AW Live Home Lampung is to change the concept of restaurants and cafes as stated in Article 31 letter E of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 Regarding tourism which reads "The business field of food and beverage services includes the types of businesses:

- a. Restoran;
- b. Restaurant;
- c. Bar/Pub;
- d. Coffee;
- e. Food sales centers;
- f. "A service"

It becomes Article 31 letter G concerning "the business field of entertainment and recreation implementation, among others, including the type of business;

- a. Sports recreational courts, among others, include types of golf courses, billiard houses, swimming courts, tennis courts, bowling alleys, futsal courts, ice skating businesses and physical fitness centers/fitness centers;
- b. Art courts, among others, include types of businesses: art studios, art galleries, art performance halls, and cinema businesses;
- c. Game arenas, among others, include types of game arena businesses, manual/mechanical/electronic agility game court businesses and children's game rides;
- d. Entertainment, among others, includes types of businesses: clubs, discos, and pubs;
- e. Massage parlors, among others, cover the types of businesses: traditional massage parlors, and reflex massage parlors;
- f. Recreational parks, among others, include types of businesses; theme parks, and fishing ponds;
- g. Karaoke."

Based on the above theoretical description, it can be analyzed that the inhibiting factors of the Implementation of Article 31E of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning tourism are from the existence of internal and external factors.

Internal factors are factors that arise in the body and are directly related to institutions and legal actors that are obstacles to law enforcement against violations of culinary tourism permits in Bandar Lampung City in terms of regional regulations that should be more complex to regulate the concept of culinary tourism, as well as the lack of supervision and human resources that should be carried out by the authorized agencies, namely Satpol PP, DPMPTSP and the Tourism Office. As stated in Article 34 of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning tourism, namely:

- (1) Tourism management is carried out through planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation, coaching and supervision.
- (2) In tourism management, it must be integrated with existing tourism problems.

External factors are factors from outside law enforcement, apart from outside law enforcement, it also includes the factor of facilities or facilities. External factors that are obstacles to the enforcement of the law on culinary tourism are the community and business actors. People who take advantage of the crowd of visitors, namely parking attendants, position vehicles in various corners of the culinary tourism environment so as to cause violations in public order. The activities of business actors who do not comply with regulations and public order are one of the external factors that hinder the implementation of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism. Changing the concept of the type of business, not complying with the rules on the number of visitors to the noise from the music of business actors causes friction in society and public order.

CONCLUSION

The implementation of Article 31E of the Bandar Lampung City Regulation No. 03 of 2017 concerning Tourism has not been implemented to the maximum, because there are still violations committed by Tourism business actors in culinary businesses, such as Angles wing and Xo Stars Coffee in Bandar Lampung City. There is still a lack of supervision carried out by the Bandar Lampung City Tourism Office and other government agencies in Bandar Lampung City's culinary business activities such as the theory of the legal system, namely the substance of the law, the legal structure, and the culture of the law.

An Inhibiting Factor in the Culinary Tourism Licensing Process in Bandar Lampung City is the existence of illegal activities carried out by culinary tourism

entrepreneurs. Inhibiting Factors are divided into internal factors and external factors, where internal factors are factors that appear in the body and are directly related to institutions and legal actors that are obstacles to law enforcement against violations of culinary tourism permits in the city of Bandar Lampung and external factors are factors from outside law enforcement, External factors that are obstacles to the enforcement of the law on culinary tourism are the community and business actors such as legal policy theory put forward by Thomas R Dye.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Akasi, A., B, E., & Anggalana. (2021). Pertanggungjawaban Pidana Penganiaya Bersama Terhadap Orang Di Depan Umum Yang Menimbulkan Cedera (Studi Kasus Nomor 6/Pid.B/2018/Pn Sdn Tahun 2018). *Jurnal Pro Justitia (JPJ)*, 2(2), 40.
- Alam, Y. S., & Erlina, B. (2021). *Analisis Putusan terhadap Pelaku Tindak Pidana Penggelapan Dalam Jabatan (Studi Putusan Nomor 431 / Pid . B / 2020 / PN Tjk)*. 2(2), 32–39.
- Barusman, T. M., Rama, A., Barusman, P., Yusuf, M., Barusman, S., & Redaputri, A. P. (2021). 796 *LINGUISTICA ANTVERPIENSIA Antecedent of Tourists' Behavioral Intentions and the Effect of Travel Companions as Moderating Variable on Nature Based Tourism*. www.hivt.be
- Besta, I. La. (2024). Analisis Prosedur Perizinan Berusaha Dalam Menjaga Kelestarian Lingkungan. *Justicia Sains: Jurnal Ilmu Hukum*, 9(1), 1–17. <https://doi.org/10.24967/jcs.v9i1.2752>
- Hartono, B. (2011). Analisis Pelaksanaan Pidana Ganti Kerugian (Denda) dalam Tindak Pidana Korupsi. *Keadilan Progresif, Vol 2, No 1 (2011): Maret*, 1–14. <http://jurnal.ubl.ac.id/index.php/KP/article/view/73>
- Jainah, Z. O. (2023). *[PENA JUSTISIA: MEDIA KOMUNIKASI DAN KAJIAN HUKUM] Zainab Ompu Jainah : Implementation of Criminal Sanctions Against Foreign Narcotics Courier Performers Implementation of Criminal Sanctions Against Foreign Narcotics Courier Performers (Vol. 22, Issue 1)*.
- Negara, K. S., Rusli, T., & Hapsari, R. A. (2021). Perlindungan Data Konsumen Pengguna Fintech Terhadap Penyalahgunaan Data Baik Sengaja Maupun Tidak Sengaja Terhadap Serangan Hacker dan Malware (Studi Pada Lembaga Perlindungan Konsumen di Lampung). *Binamulia Hukum*, 10(1). <https://doi.org/10.37893/jbh.v10i1.246>

- Pasamai, S. (2020). EFFECTIVENESS OF REGISTRATION OF LAND FOR THE LAND USING THE LEGAL SATISFACTION OF LAND (Study of the Land Office of Mamuju Regency). In *Meraja Journal* (Vol. 3, Issue 2).
- Robert Enakesda, & Zainab Ompu Jainah. (2024). Reposisi Peran Justice Collaborator Dalam Upaya Memberantas Tindak Pidana Korupsi. *INNOVATIVE: Journal Of Social Science Research*, 4.
- Rusli, T., & Ompu Jainah, Z. (2024). *[PENAJUSTISIA: MEDIA KOMUNIKASI DAN KAJIAN HUKUM] Protection And Legal Security System For Digital Signature Users As Consumers In The Indonesian Legal System* (Vol. 23, Issue 2).
- Rusli, T., Zaini, Z. D., Andrias, D., Desta, M., Kurniawan, I., & Jaya, I. (n.d.). *DISPARITY OF JUDGES' RULINGS REGARDING 2 OBJECTS OF SECURITY CONFIDENTIALITY 3 UNDER THE FIDUCIARY LAW IN SIMPLE 4 LAWSUITS 5. 70*. <https://doi.org/10.3390/xxxxx>
- Siregig, K., Ramadhan, S., Nasawijaya, M. Y., Hukum, F., & Bandar, U. (2021). *Implementation of Criminal Sanctions Against Officials Without the Right To Transmit Electronic Information*. 3(no 02).
- Zainab Ompu Jainah, & Fasholli Milyar Sulaiman. (n.d.). Pertanggung Jawaban Anak di Bawah Umur Telah Terbukti Secara Sah dan Meyakinkan Bersalah Melakukan Tindak Pidana Membawa Senjata Tajam (Studi Putusan Nomor: 48/Pid.Sus-Anak/2023/Pn Tjk). *INNOVATIVE: Journal Of Social Science Research*, 4(1).